

手首装着型心拍計は胸部装着型よりも正確さに欠ける (Abstract 17-A-10265)

心拍計の正確さはデバイス、活動のタイプおよび運動強度により異なる

Accuracy of heart rate monitors varies by device, activity type and exercise intensity

研究者らは5つの一般的な手首装着型フィットネストラッカー（アップルウォッチ、Fitbitなど）を試し、様々なタイプの運動や運動強度においてどの程度正確に心拍を計測できるかを調査した。その結果に基づくと、特に活動中の心拍モニターが必要な人においては、旧式の胸帯モニターが最良であった。手首に装着するフィットネストラッカーは、心拍数を過大および過小評価した。誤差は、活動のタイプにより1分当たり±34拍から±15拍の範囲であった。このスタディ結果は、American College of Cardiology's 66th Annual Scientific Sessionで発表された。

Full Text

Researchers at Cleveland Clinic put five popular wrist-worn fitness trackers to the test to find out how accurately they gauge heart rate across several types of exercise and intensity levels. Based on their findings, the old-fashioned chest strap monitor is best, particularly for people who need to monitor their heart rate during activity, according to the study team. The standard chest strap was the most accurate regardless of the intensity of the workout or whether someone was using the treadmill, elliptical or stationary bike.

The results were presented at the American College of Cardiology's 66th Annual Scientific Session. This study builds on earlier research by the same team that assessed a different set of heart rate monitors and was limited only to walking or jogging on a treadmill.

Heart rate is often used as part of a formula to calculate how many calories are being burned during exercise. However, for people with heart problems, an accurate heart rate reading is important.

"If you need to know your heart rate with accuracy when exercising — either because you are training for a marathon or have safe heart rate limits set by your doctor, perhaps due to coronary artery disease, heart failure or other heart conditions — wrist-worn monitors are less accurate than the standard chest strap," said Marc Gillinov, MD, The Judith Dion Pyle Chair in Heart Valve Research, Thoracic and Cardiovascular Surgery at the Cleveland Clinic, Ohio and the study's lead author. "We found these devices can equally over- and underestimate heart rate. The error ranged from +/- 34 beats per minute to +/- 15 beats per minute, depending on the type of activity."

This single-center study included 50 volunteers, mostly Cleveland Clinic employees, who responded to internet notices and flyers. They were 38 years old on average (±12 years), 43 percent female and generally healthy. Each participant was fitted with a continuous 4-lead electrocardiogram (EKG), a chest monitor and an armband (Scosche Rhythm+). They were then randomly fitted with two of four different wearable heart rate monitors (one on each wrist). The devices chosen for testing (Apple Watch, Fitbit Blaze, Garmin Forerunner 235, and TomTom Spark Cardio) were based on their popularity and sales figures. Researchers then recorded volunteers' heart rates at rest and after light, moderate and vigorous exercise across three types of activities, including the treadmill, stationary bike and elliptical (with and without hand levers). Measurements on the wearable devices were compared to readings from the chest strap and EKG. Participants exercised for a total of 18 minutes; one dropped off at the final stage due to fatigue.

The chest strap monitor closely matched readings from the electrocardiogram (EKG), which is the gold standard for measuring the heart's activity (level of agreement with EKG, $rc=0.996$; 1 being perfect agreement); however, the wrist-worn devices were less accurate on average (level of agreement with EKG, $rc=0.67-0.92$). While the watch-style heart rate monitors may accurately report heart rate at rest, and most were acceptable on the treadmill, they were fairly inaccurate while bicycling or using the elliptical. Of the wrist-worn heart rate monitors, only the Apple Watch provided accurate heart rate readings when participants switched to the elliptical trainer without arm levers; none gave correct measurements when they used arm levers. The wrist and forearm monitors also became less accurate the more intense the activity levels, with the exception of the Apple Watch.

"Even though all these wrist-worn monitors work by the same general principles, there is considerable variation among them," Gillinov said. "Overall, they were most accurate when someone was using the treadmill at low intensity and worst when exercising on the elliptical at high intensity."

What's behind the discrepancies? Unlike the chest strap, which like the EKG measures electrical activity of the heart, wrist-worn monitors use optical sensing or light to measure blood flow.

"It's not measuring what the heart does, but rather [downstream] blood flow — basically the volume of blood in the tissue," Gillinov said, adding that these devices also introduce many more variables that can result in incorrect readings (e.g., insufficient contact with the skin because of sweating or poor fit, skin pigmentation).

The bottom line, Gillinov said, is that the wrist-worn devices don't provide the full picture; nor are they intended to be medical devices.

"We are just at the beginning of a revolution in personal management of health by virtue of wearable physiological monitoring," Gillinov said. "As people take more control of their health and record their own physiological data, they need to know how accurate it is; this is especially concerning for people with heart conditions that can be exacerbated [with activity]. Cardiologists can use this data and decide which monitor they would recommend and help educate patients about their limitations."

This study is limited due to its small size. Researchers say larger studies are needed and should also evaluate how these devices perform in measuring heart rate in people who have heart failure, diabetes, are recovering from heart attack or are obese.

ACC2017特集

[News01]

エボロクマブは心血管イベントを有意に低下させた関連付ける

[News02]

自己拡張型経カテーテル的大動脈弁置換術 (TAVR)は中等度リスクの患者に適している

[News03]

NSAIDに加えてミソプロストールを服用することにより心血管系リスクが低下する

[News04]

手首装着型心拍計は胸部装着型よりも正確さに欠ける

[News05]

ホルモン補充療法は死亡率が低いことと関連がある

[News06]

MI後の睡眠時無呼吸スクリーニングに最適な時期が調査された

[News07]

運動歴は乳がん後の心疾患予防に役立つ

[News08]

うつ病はMIまたは狭心症後の死亡リスクを倍増させる

[News09]

MI直後にすべての閉塞動脈を治療することによる有益性

[News10]

リバーロキサバンはアスピリンに比べVTE再発を軽減する

[News11]

CTスキャンは大動脈弁置換術後の弁尖の動きの低下を可視化する

[News12]

BococizumabによるPCSK9阻害による結果は様々である

[News13]

TAVRは微小出血および神経学的障害と関連がある

[News14]

スタチン服用患者においてエボロクマブは認知機能に影響しない

[News15]

左心耳閉鎖術は脳卒中リスクを低下させる

[News16]

ペースメーカープログラムは意識消失発作を減少させる

[News17]

心房細動患者においてジゴキシンにより死亡リスクは上昇する

[News18]

新規抗凝固薬は心房細動に対するアブレーション中の大出血を軽減する

[News19]

血液検査により非心臓手術後の心損傷が検出できる

[News20]

ウェブベースのカウンセリングは血圧を低下させる